ONE DAY SYMPOSIUM
HERITAGE UNDER FIRE
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Host &amp; Sponsors</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welcome</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstracts and Biographies</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Select Relevant Publications</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Useful Information</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Host: The Alfred Deakin Institute, Deakin University

The Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation (ADI) is an internationally recognised and highly regarded social sciences and humanities research institute.

Visit: http://www.deakin.edu.au/adi

Sponsor: Blue Shield Australia

Blue Shield Australia is a member of Blue Shield International – an international committee, working to protect the world’s cultural heritage threatened by armed conflict and natural disasters.


Sponsor: The Australian Department of Defence

The mission of the Australian Department of Defence is to understand the opportunities and challenges for Australia's future defence and security needs.

Welcome

Dear Friends and Colleagues,

It is with great pleasure that I welcome you to this symposium on the topic “Heritage Under Fire”.

The ongoing conflicts in Syria and Iraq have unleashed a cataclysmic wave of human suffering as well as an unprecedented period of heritage destruction.

The monumental scale of this heritage destruction has brought back to centre stage a number of issues pertaining to the protection of cultural property during conflict.

This one day symposium brings together leading heritage scholars, practitioners, defence personnel, NGO’s concerned with heritage issues, political scientists, policy-makers, and archaeologists to focus on the theme of Cultural Property Protection in Conflict.

These issues, and the wide array of opinions in the room, are sure to stimulate a very interesting and challenging discussion.

This symposium would not have been possible without the generous support of our host, the Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalization at Deakin University. I am also grateful to our sponsors, Blue Shield Australia and the Australian Department of Defence. This symposium would not have been possible without their commitment and I would like to take this opportunity to thank them for their collective efforts.

I look forward to meeting and talking with you over the day and please let me know if you need anything at all.

Kind regards,

A/Prof Benjamin Isakhan
Program

Friday 2 February 2018

830-9: Registration

9-930: Official Introduction and Welcome – Chair: Prof Andrea Witcomb
Prof Andrea Witcomb – Welcome on behalf of the Alfred Deakin Institute
Ian Travers – Welcome on behalf of Blue Shield Australia and ICOMOS Australia
A/Prof Benjamin Isakhan – Introduction to the Symposium

930-1030: Keynote Address 1 – Chair: A/Prof Benjamin Isakhan
Prof Peter Stone – Protecting Cultural Property in Conflict: Critical Responsibility or Distraction?

1030-11: Morning tea

11-12: Panel 1 – Chair: Dr Antonio Zarandona
Tara Gutman – What Role for Humanitarians in Protecting Cultural Property in Armed Conflict?
Prof Claire Smith – The Impact of Cultural Values on Socially Mediated Terrorism

12-1: Panel 2 – Chair: Dr Ross Burns
Dr Antonio Zarandona – The Islamic State attacks on Yezidis and Christians
A/Prof Benjamin Isakhan – The Islamic State attacks on Shia Holy Sites and the Shia Response

1-2: Lunch

2-3: Keynote Address 2 – Chair: Prof Peter Stone
Dr Ross Burns – Syria’s Cultural Heritage in Conflict: Aleppo as a Case Study

3-330: Afternoon tea

330-430: Panel 3 – Chair: Prof Claire Smith
Sofya Shahab – The Ritualization of Rubble in Revolution
Dr Dianne Fitzpatrick – How Archaeological Practice Contributes to the Illicit Trade in Antiquities

430-530: Panel 4 – Chair: Tara Gutman
Robyn Riddett – Documenting Heritage at Risk in Syria and Iraq: A Foundation for the Future
Melathi Saldin – Heritage and Resilience of Muslim minority communities in post-war Sri Lanka

530-535: Closing Remarks – A/Prof Benjamin Isakhan
Abstracts and Biographies

Official Introduction and Welcome

Welcome on behalf of the Alfred Deakin Institute

Prof Andrea Witcomb

Andrea Witcomb is Professor of Cultural Heritage and Museum Studies and Deputy Director (Governance) of the Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation at Deakin University, Australia. She is a world leading expert on the history and theory of museums and the uses of heritage to develop cross-cultural understanding. Her current research projects include the ARC funded project ‘Collecting the West’.

Welcome on behalf of Blue Shield Australia and ICOMOS Australia

Ian Travers

Ian Travers is President of ICOMOS Australia and a Senior Associate with Extent Heritage in Melbourne. He is a specialist archaeologist but with a multi-disciplinary outlook and broad understanding and experience in the management of built heritage, historic infrastructure, industrial and mining heritage, cultural landscapes and intangible heritage values. Ian studied archaeology at the University of Liverpool and gained a Masters degree in Archaeological Heritage Management at the University of York.

Introduction to the Symposium

A/Prof Benjamin Isakhan

Benjamin Isakhan is Associate Professor of Politics and Policy Studies and Founding Director of Polis, a research network for Politics and International Relations in the Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation at Deakin University, Australia. He is also Adjunct Senior Research Associate, Department of Politics and International Relations at the University of Johannesburg, South Africa. He is the Chief Investigator on the project ‘Measuring Cultural Property Destruction in Iraq and Syria’.

Keynote Address 1

Protecting Cultural Property in Conflict: Critical Responsibility or Distraction?

Cultural property is always damaged and destroyed during conflict – it is what happens, and there is nothing that can be done about it. However, such damage and destruction is frequently avoidable and has been regarded as bad practice by military theorists for over 2,000 years. During both the First and Second World Wars military units were created to try to protect cultural property. These were largely broken up at the end of the Second
World War and, despite the 1954 Hague Convention on the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict and its two Protocols of 1954 and 1999, the military - and heritage community - essentially forgot the importance of trying to protect cultural property during conflict. It was only following the disastrous destruction and looting that followed the war in the former Yugoslavia and the 2003 invasion of Iraq that the issue returned to the agenda. The Blue Shield organisation was created in 1996 in an attempt to raise the profile of cultural property protection. Since then it has worked with the military and other relevant organisations to flag the importance of this work. Progress has been slow but recently significant steps have been taken.

Prof Peter Stone

Professor Peter Stone is the UNESCO Chair in Cultural Property Protection and Peace at Newcastle University in the UK; Chair of the UK Committee of the Blue Shield; and Vice President of Blue Shield International. In 2003 he was advisor to the UK’s Ministry of Defence regarding the identification and protection of the archaeological cultural heritage in Iraq. His article ‘The 4 Tier approach’ led directly to the establishment of a Joint Service Cultural Property Protection Unit in UK forces to become operational in 2019/20.

Panel 1

What Role for Humanitarians in Protecting Cultural Property in Armed Conflict?

Traditionally the work of the humanitarian sector has focussed on the means of survival of people made vulnerable by natural disasters and man-made ones, such as armed conflict. As contemporary conflicts have increasingly been the site of disputes over cultural issues, so too have culturally significant objects and places increasingly become the deliberate object of belligerents. The right to practice one’s own culture is not only a recognised human right, but also a humanitarian one, inherent in the well-being, safety and dignity of people caught up in armed conflicts. Recognising the humanitarian impact of the destruction of significant cultural property on affected communities as well as the gravity of the loss of cultural heritage to humanity globally, the Red Cross Red Crescent Movement has sharpened its focus in this field. This paper will consider the possible future role for humanitarians in protecting cultural property and discuss recent achievements of Australian Red Cross.

Tara Gutman

Tara Gutman is International Humanitarian Law (IHL) Legal Adviser - Government Relations in the IHL and Movement Relations Department at Australian Red Cross, a role concerned with supporting the Australian government to implement the laws of war. She curated the photographic exhibition, Culture Under Attack, funded by the Attorney-General’s Department on the protection of cultural property in armed conflict which is currently touring Australia. Previous positions include Legal Consultant to the Khmer Rouge Trials Taskforce (2003-2006), Visiting Professional at the ICC and Visiting Scholar at George
The impact of cultural values on socially mediated terrorism

The presentation analyses social media responses to the Da’esh/Islamic State attacks in Paris, on January 7, 2015, and November 13, 2015. It considers how Da’esh uses cultural values associated with the West to strengthen its socially mediated terrorism. Extremist groups are nurtured by conflicting values. Da’esh, in particular, is sophisticated in the manner in which it uses cultural values to target specific audiences. The symbolic responses of its opponents can be predicted and may inadvertently further its aims. We need to be cautious of symbolic reactions that divide Muslims and non-Muslims. We need emblems that act against the xenophobia that is a recruiting tool for jihadists. We need to be more aware of the role that cultural icons play in conflict situations. If cultural heritage sites are to be protected, it is essential that we understand the diverse values that different people bring to these sites. Above all, we need greater understanding of, and respect for, each other’s cultural and heritage values.

Prof Claire Smith

Professor Claire Smith is an archaeologist and Dean (Research) for the College of Humanities, Arts and Social Sciences, Flinders University. She has produced 9 books and more than 130 publications in English, Spanish, Catalan, Arabic, Russian, Portuguese and Japanese. She is editor of the Encyclopedia of Global Archaeology. As the twice-elected President of the World Archaeological Congress (2003-2014) Claire Smith has built global research capacity through establishing the Archaeologists without Borders and Global Libraries Programs, supporting the establishment of a refereed journal, Archaeologies, and initiating five new international book series.

Panel 2

The Islamic State attacks on Yezidis and Christians

When the ‘Islamic State’ (IS) seized large swathes of territory across Iraq and Syria and declared their new caliphate, they unleashed a cataclysmic wave of both devastating human suffering and unprecedented heritage destruction. In terms of the human suffering, the IS has executed many who questioned their nefarious ideology or committed petty crimes. At the same time, the rapid expansion of the IS has also proved fatal for many of the world’s most sensitive and important cultural heritage sites. Targeted sites range from ancient Mesopotamian city-states through to Greek, Roman and Byzantine sites, as well as museums, art galleries and libraries. However, little attention has been paid to the intersection between the human suffering and the heritage destruction undertaken by the Islamic State (IS). Here, human/heritage destruction are intertwined: the suffering inflicted on people is projected onto their sites of ritual and worship; just as the destruction of these sites are deliberately orchestrated to inflict symbolic suffering on specific communities and to shatter the ethnic and religious diversity of the region. This talk will explore and document the human/heritage ‘cultural cleansing’ undertaken by the IS against two fragile minorities: the Yezidi and Christian populations of northern Iraq and Syria.
José Antonio González Zarandona is an Associate Research Fellow at the Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation. He researches in heritage destruction, iconoclasm, vandalism and related issues in Australia and the Middle East using interdisciplinary methods of study. He has published in the Cambridge Archaeological Journal and the International Journal of Heritage Studies.

The Islamic State attacks on Shia Holy Sites and the Shia Response

After conquering large swathes of Syria and Iraq, the IS undertook an aggressive sectarian campaign in which they not only enacted horrific violence against the Shia people, but also damaged or destroyed several key Shia mosques and shrines. Drawing on Social Movement Theory (SMT), this article analyzes the response by various Shia non-state actors—militia leaders, religious clergymen, populist preachers and seminal poets. It argues that they used the IS threat to Shia holy sites to develop and deploy a mobilization frame that has come to be referred to as the “shrine protection narrative.” The article also documents the manifold consequences of the shrine protection narrative: it underpinned a mass recruitment drive that saw tens of thousands enlist; it legitimized foreign Shia militias to enter the conflicts in both Syria and Iraq; it justified the formation of entirely new militias who declared the centrality of shrine protection to their mandate; and it mobilized them to enact political violence. In doing so, this article extends existing studies of SMT to demonstrate that “sacred spaces”—and particularly the need to protect religious sites from specific threats—can serve as a powerful mobilization frame towards political violence.

A/Prof Benjamin Isakhan

See earlier.

Keynote Address 2

Syria’s Cultural Heritage in Conflict: Aleppo as a Case Study

What has the experience of Aleppo taught us about the pattern of destruction in this famed ancient city? Is there a systematic pattern to the destruction of its historical monuments? Have commentators over-stated the extent of the damage, almost writing off Aleppo in the process? Who contributed most to the pattern of damage? Has the damage to the old city been hyped in comparison to the devastation of much of the civilian housing and infrastructure in East Aleppo, confusing two patterns of warfare? And what hopes are there for reconstruction?

Dr Ross Burns
Dr Ross Burns has written a number of books on the history and archaeology of Syria and its main cities (Damascus and Aleppo). His experience of Syria goes back to his time as Australian Ambassador there in the mid-eighties and frequent visits from his retirement in 2003 up to 2011. His website www.monumentsofsyria.com tracks the extent of damage to the archaeological sites and buildings recorded in his first book Monuments of Syria (I B Tauris 1992, 1999 and 2009).

Panel 3

The Ritualization of Rubble in Revolution

The destruction of cultural heritage has long been used as a tool in the formation and reformation of society, marking a transition from the old regime to the new. Analysis of the targeting of archaeological and cultural sites by the Islamic State has, to date, primarily focused upon the relationship between historical acts of iconoclasm and their wider symbolism as part of a carefully mediated propaganda campaign. Building upon existing research on the anthropology of political revolutions and male initiation rituals, this paper will examine the intentional destruction of historical monuments in Iraq and Syria as a form of ritual within the wider ritual of revolution. Through an exploration of the politicisation of cultural heritage, iconoclastic propaganda and the ritual process, this paper demonstrates that the heritage destruction wrought by the Islamic State functions as part of a broader practise of ritualisation that is instrumental in forming bonds between members and ensuring their allegiance. Such analysis of the ritualisation of heritage destruction is vital in understanding how groups such as the Islamic State successfully transform young men into a violent communitas, as well as furthering understanding of, and responding to, attacks on heritage sites.

Sofya Shahab

Sofya Shahab is a PhD student at the Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation. Her research employs an anthropological lens to explore the weaponisation of affect, its modes of transmissions, and experiences of violence, through a focus on the cultural property destruction undertaken by the Islamic State in Iraq and Syria. Sofya has spent the last five years working in humanitarian and development assistance across the Middle East and has an MSc in Social Anthropology from Oxford University.

How Archaeological Practice Contributes to the Illicit Trade in Antiquities

Nothing would strike more fear into the hearts of most archaeological project directors working in the Middle East than a sudden request by their local antiquities directorate to provide a detailed inventory specifying the contents of their on-site storage depots or a call for specific information concerning the whereabouts of each significant artefact retained under the project’s protective care. There are practical and ethical reasons why archaeological practice should benchmark itself to reflect fundamental quality principles that manage risks such as these. Currently, the arbitrary application of quality principles underpins approaches used by a very high percentage of archaeological research projects.
However, the absence of standard measures outlined in international charters and local regulations means that archaeological collections are managed subjectively and that at any time an on-site storage depot may contain great quantities; perhaps accumulated over decades, of archaeological material vulnerable to damage or theft. Although archaeologists may have every good intention of working on backlogs and administrative tasks during study seasons a sudden outbreak of armed conflict may prevent researchers from returning to a site for years, or perhaps ever, to collect and record relational data about artefacts and collections. This can mean that, in the case of illicitly traded antiquities, unauthorised personnel illegally removing artefacts from sites may have unfettered access to unknown quantities of unrecorded, unregistered, unanalysed and untraceable artefacts of some worth to private collectors. This presentation aims to encourage dialogue about archaeological practice that can reduce risks like these.

Dr Dianne Fitzpatrick

Dianne Fitzpatrick is an archaeologist, who has worked in Australia, Israel, Jordan, South Africa, Syria and Turkey. Her doctoral research was part of the Australian-Syrian Research Collaboration Project at the University of Melbourne, Classics and Archaeology Program entitled, ‘Collections at Risk: an examination of archaeological collections management practices in the Near East.’ She is a member of ICOMOS/ICAHM and has been the Collections Manager at the Australian Institute of Archaeology since 2008.

Panel 4

Documenting Heritage at Risk in Syria and Iraq: a Foundation for the Future

Damage to cultural heritage in the Middle East is often due to war and sometimes to intentional destruction or neglect. Risk preparedness, monitoring, small or large-scale reconstruction and recovery activities require good documentation and trained actors, as recommended by ICOMOS, for an excellent outcome.

Before the war cultural heritage sites had been documented by a wide range of actors from scholarly institutions, NGOs, amateurs to public crowd sourcing. Records are held in universities such as Durham and Oxford, and other countries where the records are safe. In Syria, the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) had a good paper inventory largely inherited from the 20th century, with a treasure of documentation like the 1930s restoration works in Palmyra, early photographs of the Azem Palace, a plan of the lost Jobar synagogue, etc. During the hostilities, there was no or limited access to cultural sites and so efforts were concentrated on digitizing existing documentation, surveying and photographing damaged sites, monitoring on-ground events and safeguarding cadastral records and property registers for urban areas. Maps, 3D images, geographical coordinates and GIS locations have also been produced and experts have been able to analyse them. Many of these efforts have been undertaken and/or funded by international actors such as UNESCO, ICOMOS and its partners ICCROM – Athar, ARC/WH, Global Heritage Fund, Prince Claus Fund, CyArk, Yale University, Arcadia Fund; General Organisation for the Protection of the Historic Cities of Yemen (GOPHCY), DGAM and others.
Also as preparation for future recovery, capacity building has been included within local relevant institutions for the training of young professionals devoted to their cultural heritage. In Syria, DGAM provides trainees and oversees activity and UNESCO provides logistical support in nearby Beirut. ICOMOS - ICORP, in co-operation with ICCROM, held an e-learning course for Syrian cultural heritage professionals in 2013 at the Damascus National Museum and in Yemen the use of new programmes with simple tools for rapid survey and photography of damaged sites was experimented with.

Good documentation and timely training towards action and emergency response will increase efficiency now and improve resources later, in the post-conflict phase until peace and stability return to the region. This paper will discuss the activities of the ICOMOS Working Group on the Safeguarding of Cultural Heritage in Syria and Iraq, the ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Risk Preparedness (ICORP) and their partner organizations.

Robyn Riddett

Robyn Riddett, Treasurer – ICORP, past Blue Shield and Blue Shield Australia Board member. This paper is co-authored by: Samir Abdulac, Chair ICOMOS Working Group on the Safeguarding of Cultural Heritage in Syria and Iraq, ICORP, Blue Shield France; and Bijan Rouhani, Vice-chair of ICOMOS Working Group for Safeguarding of Cultural Heritage in Syria and Iraq, Vice-President ICORP, Blue Shield Board, Endangered Archaeology in the Middle East & North Africa (Oxford).

Heritage and Resilience of Muslim minority communities in post-war Sri Lanka

The nearly three-decade long Sri Lankan Civil War ended in May 2009. The war was a result of the struggle for a separatist Tamil homeland – Eelam – and was waged between the Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam (LTTE) and the Sri Lankan Government forces. As with conflicts elsewhere, Sri Lanka’s armed struggle was also accompanied by rhetorical wars over archaeological sites and place names, as well as the political use of the national past. Despite the end of armed hostilities in 2009, the post-war period continues to witness the escalating and often heritage-centric violence against other ethno-religious minorities, notably the Muslims, with archaeological knowledge and practice increasingly used to question their belonging, legitimacy and identity. Given this situation, this paper seeks to understand the ways through which this community responds to the diverse challenges to their wellbeing, notably those challenges emerging from when their heritage is under fire.

Whilst threats to the Muslim community arising from the dissonance, conflict and contestation of heritage sites and landscapes have been explored in depth, less evident are the ways through which they exercise heritage/ cultural resilience for identity affirmation, empowerment and cultural survival in the face of such adversities. This paper pursues a framework of heritage resilience as a productive means from which to understand these entanglements, as well as the complex landscape of post-war cultural politics and also explore ways through which a socially equitable and democratic heritage may be achieved for all Sri Lankans.
Melathi Saldin

Melathi Saldin obtained her BA (Honours) and Master of Philosophy in Archaeology from the University of Kelaniya, Sri Lanka, where she also served as a faculty member from 2007-2014. She has worked with the British-Sri Lanka explorations at the UNESCO World Heritage Site of Anuradhapura (the Upper Malwatu Oya Exploration Project) as well as at the UNESCO World Heritage Site of Sigiriya, Sri Lanka. She received the Vice Chancellor’s Award for Outstanding Young Researcher in Social Sciences, University of Kelaniya in 2008 and 2009 and was awarded the Deakin University Postgraduate Research Scholarship in 2015. Her research interests are in the areas of post-conflict heritage, heritage resilience, South Asian archaeology and the Sri Lankan Malay Diaspora.

Melathi is currently a PhD candidate at the Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation, Deakin University, Melbourne. Her research looks at the politicisation of heritage and archaeology and how this informs the way ethnic minorities negotiate and position themselves and their heritage within the complex local-global interplay of cultural politics, and its wider implications for the democratisation of heritage and archaeology, with special reference to post-war Sri Lanka.
Select Relevant Publications

Prof Peter Stone


Dr Ross Burns


Prof Claire Smith

- Smith, C., Burke, H., de Leiuen, C. & Jackson, G. 2016. The Islamic State’s Symbolic War: Daesh’s Socially Mediated Terrorism as a Threat to Cultural Heritage. Journal of Social Archaeology, 16(2), 164-188.

Tara Gutman


A/Prof Benjamin Isakhan

Dr José Antonio González Zarandona


Dr Dianne Fitzpatrick


Sofya Shahab


Melathi Saldin

Other Useful Information

Location and Directions
This symposium will be held at Deakin Downtown which is located in Melbourne's central business district at:

Level 12, Tower 2
727 Collins Street
Melbourne Victoria 3008

Public Transport
Deakin University Melbourne City Centre is accessible via public transport. Plan your trip via the PTV website.